

RESOLUTION APPROVING AMENDMENT TO PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH INTEGRITY APPRAISAL SERVICES, INC. FOR REVALUATION APPRAISAL SERVICES, AUDITOR'S OFFICE

WHEREAS, David Thomas, Ashtabula County Auditor, has presented an Amendment to the Professional Services Agreement with Integrity Appraisal Services, Inc. for revaluation appraisal services, for the approval of the Board, to-wit:

Original Contract Date: April 23, 2024 by Resolution 2024-219

Provider: Integrity Appraisal Services, Inc., 5211 Mahoning Ave., Suite 230, Austintown, OH 44515

Scope: appraisal and revaluation for assessment purposes of all taxable real property and exempt real property situated within the boundaries of Ashtabula County. This encompasses the critical and detailed work plan for 2026 revaluation Ashtabula County, Ohio.

Amendment: to be in compliance with the Ohio Administrative Code Sections 5705-25-08, 5705-25-08(F)(9), 5705-25-08(F)(10), and to amend Item XIII regarding jurisdiction.

WHEREAS, these amendments are more fully outlined in the amendment agreement on file; now

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, By the Board of Commissioners of Ashtabula County, Ohio that the Amendments to the Agreement are approved in accordance with the copies now on file in this office.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, except as expressly amended by this Amendment, all of the terms, conditions and provisions of the Agreement shall remain in full force and effect.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the President of the Board, on behalf of the Board of Commissioners of Ashtabula County, is authorized to execute any and all necessary documents.

**ASHTABULA COUNTY COMMISSIONERS
CERTIFICATION PAGE**

Resolution No. 2024-334

July 09, 2024

**RESOLUTION APPROVING AMENDMENT TO PROFESSIONAL SERVICES
AGREEMENT WITH INTEGRITY APPRAISAL SERVICES, INC. FOR REVALUATION
APPRAISAL SERVICES, AUDITOR'S OFFICE**

Upon the motion of Casey R. Kozlowski, seconded by J.P. Ducro IV.

VOTE:

**Kathryn L. Whittington
J.P. Ducro IV
Casey R. Kozlowski**

**Aye
Aye
Aye**

CERTIFICATE OF CLERK

IT IS HEREBY CERTIFIED that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of a resolution acted upon and duly passed by the Board of County Commissioners of Ashtabula County, Ohio, on the date noted above.



Lisa Hawkins, Clerk of the Board
Board of County Commissioners
Ashtabula County, Ohio



June 18, 2024

The Honorable David Thomas
Ashtabula County Auditor
25 West Jefferson Street
Jefferson, Ohio 44047

By email only

Dear Mr. Thomas:

We have reviewed the sexennial reappraisal contract entered into by the Ashtabula County Auditor. We find the agreement to be acceptable except for the following points.

Ohio Administrative Code Section 5703-25-08(F)(9) requires a contract for appraisal services to contain a "provision that clearly recites that there is to be no departure from the terms of the contract or no change or alterations of the same without the written approval of the tax commissioner being first obtained." The submitted contract contains a clause in Article 39 on page 22 which complies with the rule's requirement. However, the submitted contract also contains a clause, "XI. Amendment" on page 3 which states that "[a]ll changes or modifications to this Agreement shall be in writing and signed by both parties." Please either delete clause XI. Amendment from the agreement or amend the clause to require prior approval of the Tax Commissioner.

Ohio Administrative Code Section 5703-25-08(F)(10) requires that progress of work reports be reported to the Tax Commissioner on DTE Form 108. The agreement contains a clause in Article 32 Progress Reports on page 21 that must be amended to include progress reports to the Tax Commissioner.

The agreement contains a clause on page 3, XIII. Dispute Resolution that under some circumstances could conflict with the requirements of OAC 5703-25-08. This provision must be modified to reflect that the Tax Commissioner has exclusive jurisdiction to hear complaints that the contract could not be completed by an Act of God or because of elements not within the control of the appraisal firm. Additionally, this provision must be modified to ensure that the imposed timelines in the provision do not apply to disputes involving final completion of the reappraisal by the date agreed to in the contract. By rule, the county auditor must suspend payments if the reappraisal is not completed by



the agreed date. The contract provision creates a conflict by potentially imposing a delay on the suspension of payment after the agreement is not timely completed by the appraisal firm.

Please send us an executed copy of the contract once the above changes are made so that we may consider the contract for final approval.

Sincerely,

Michael Gefvert

Michael Gefvert, Esq.

Cc: D. Constance, Integrity Appraisal Services, Inc.



Ashtabula County Auditor David Thomas

25 West Jefferson Street
Jefferson, Ohio 44047-1092
Phone: 440-576-3783 ~ Fax: 440-576-3797
auditor@ashtabulacountyauditor.org

June 24, 2024

Michael Gefvert, Esq.
Ohio Department of Taxation
Columbus, Ohio 43216-0530

Dear Mr. Gefvert,

Please find attached the requested amendments to the 2026 Reappraisal contract. Should you need anything else please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'D. Thomas', is written over the word 'Sincerely,'.

David Thomas,
Ashtabula County Auditor



Where great things happen.

Ashtabula County Auditor David Thomas

25 West Jefferson Street
Jefferson, Ohio 44047-1092
Phone: 440-576-3783 ~ Fax: 440-576-3797
auditor@ashtabulacountyauditor.org

AMENDMENT TO PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT, 2026 ASHTABULA COUNTY SEXENNIAL REAPPRAISAL, ASHTABULA COUNTY, OHIO AND INTEGRITY APPRAISAL SERVICES, INC.

- 1) **Ohio Administrative Code Section 5703-25-08(F)(9) requires a contract for appraisal services to contain a “provision that clearly recites that there is to be no departure from the terms of the contract or no change or alterations of the same without the written approval of the Tax Commissioner being first obtained. The submitted contract contains a clause in Article 39 on page 22 which complies with the rule’s requirement. However, the submitted contract also contains a clause, XI. Amendment on page 3 which states that “[a]ll changes or modifications to this Agreement shall be in writing and signed by both parties.” Please either delete clause XI. Amendment from the agreement or amend the clause to require prior approval of the Tax Commissioner.**

Contract Amendment to Item XI: No amendment or modification of the terms or conditions of this agreement shall be effective without the approval of the County Auditor, the Company, and the written approval of the Tax Commissioner.

- 2) **Ohio Administrative Code 5703-25-08(F)(10) requires that progress of work reports be reported to the Tax Commissioner on DTE Form 108. The agreement contains a clause in Article 32 Progress Reports on page 21 that must be amended to include progress reports to the Tax Commissioner.**

Contract Amendment: During the course of the reappraisal project progress reports shall be made as determined and requested by the Tax Commissioner on form DTE Form 108.

- 3) **The Agreement contains a clause on page 3, Item XIII. Dispute Resolution that under some circumstances could conflict with the requirements of Ohio Administrative Code 5703-25-08. This provision must be modified to reflect that the Tax Commissioner has exclusive jurisdiction to hear complaints that the contract could not be completed by an Act of God or because elements not within the control of the appraisal firm. Additionally, this provision must be modified to ensure that the imposed timelines in the provision do not apply to disputes involving final completion of the reappraisal by the date agreed to in the contract. By rule, the county auditor must suspend payments if the reappraisal is not completed by the agreed date. The contract provision creates a conflict by potentially imposing a delay on the suspension of payment after the agreement is not timely completed by the appraisal firm.**

Contract Amendments to Item XIII:

- 1) **In the event of a difference or dispute of any kind during the performance of this contract the Tax Commissioner has exclusive jurisdiction to hear all complaints regarding the inability for the contract to be completed by the agreed upon date.**



Ashtabula County Auditor David Thomas

25 West Jefferson Street
Jefferson, Ohio 44047-1092
Phone: 440-576-3783 ~ Fax: 440-576-3797
auditor@ashtabulacountyauditor.org

Where great things happen.

- 2) Imposed timelines in this Agreement *do not* apply to disputes involving the final completion of the reappraisal by the agreed upon date in the contract. The county auditor shall suspend payments if the reappraisal is not completed in accordance with the date agreed on in the contract.

Amendments agreed upon by the parties:

 6/21/24

Douglas R. Constance, President
Integrity Appraisal Services, Inc. Date

 6/27/26

David Thomas, Auditor
Ashtabula County Auditor's Office Date

 7-9-24

Kathryn Whittington, President
Ashtabula County Board of County Commissioners Date



Office of Auditor of State
88 East Broad Street
Post Office Box 1140
Columbus, OH 43216-1140

Auditor of State - Unresolved Findings for Recovery Certified Search

(614) 466-4514
(800) 282-0370

I have searched The Auditor of State's unresolved findings for recovery database using the following criteria:

Contractor's Information:

Name: ,
Organization: **integrity appraisal**
Date: **7/8/2024 1:09:29 PM**

This search produced the following list of 4 possible matches:

Name/Organization	Address
Franklinton Preparatory Academy	4721 Reading Rd.
McInturff, Chad	525 Summit Avenue
The International Preparatory School	1301 East 9th Street, Suite 1900
Vintage Coins and Cards AKA Vintage Coins and Collectibles	

The above list represents possible matches for the search criteria you entered. Please note that pursuant to ORC 9.24, only the person (which includes an organization) actually named in the finding for recovery is prohibited from being awarded a contract.

If the person you are searching for appears on this list, it means that the person has one or more findings for recovery and is prohibited from being awarded a contract described in ORC 9.24, unless one of the exceptions in that section apply.

If the person you are searching for does not appear on this list, an initialed copy of this page can serve as documentation of your compliance with ORC 9.24(E).

Please note that pursuant to ORC 9.24, it is the responsibility of the public office to verify that a person to whom it plans to award a contract does not appear in the Auditor of State's database. The Auditor of State's office is not responsible for inaccurate search results caused by user error or other circumstances beyond the Auditor of State's control.

State of Ohio Debarment List

State agencies given the authority to debar suppliers by the Ohio Revised Code (R.C.) are the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC), the Ohio Department of Transportation (ODOT), the Department of Administrative Services (DAS), and the Ohio Secretary of State. Respectively, debarment authority is given to these agencies by R.C. [153.02](#), [5513.06](#), [125.25](#). The reasons for debarment are also prescribed by these statutes.

A debarred supplier cannot participate (i.e., do any work in any capacity) in any State agency contracts until the debarment period expires. Neither the Ohio Revised Code nor the Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) establish prescribed debarment periods. Instead, these are determined on a case-by-case basis.

When conducting procurements, State agencies are required to use the Statewide Debarment List. For agencies using OhioBuys, suppliers' profiles can be referenced to determine their debarment status, plus systematic controls are in place preventing debarred vendors from doing business with State agencies. Additionally, agencies must use the Ohio Secretary of State's [Debarred Contractors List](#) and the United States General Services Administration's [System for Award Management \(SAM\)](#) list of federally debarred suppliers. State agencies are prohibited from awarding contracts, funded in whole or in part with state and/or federal funds, to any person or company on any of these lists.

integrity appraisal

Show 25 entries

Vendor

Vendor ID Address

No matching records found

Showing 0 to 0 of 0 entries (filtered from 33 total entries)

Previous

Next